



**Arlington Historic District Commissions
Approved Minutes of June 23, 2022
(approved 8/25/22 AHDC Meeting)**

Commissioners

Present:

D. Baldwin, C. Barry, M. Bush (joined late at 820pm), P Chaves, B Cohen,
A. Johnson (joined late at approx.. 830pm), B. Melofchik,
S. Makowka, C. Tee, J Warden,

Commissioners

Not Present:

S. Savarese

Guests:

C. Harris, N. Spadorcia, C. Schultz, N. Schultz, L. Leahy, N. Aikenhead,
M. Halliday,

- 1. AHDC Meeting Opens 8:00pm**
- 2. Approval of draft minutes from May 26, 2022 Regular and Executive Session Minutes.**
Regular minutes of 5/26/22 moved for approval by C. Barry, seconded by C. Tee, roll call to approve regular minutes – Barry – y, Tee – y, Worden – y, Chaves – y, Cohen – y, Melofchik – abstained, Makowka -y, Baldwin – y. Executive Session Minutes not discussed at all.
- 3. Appointment of Alternate Commissioners – Jason/ Pleasant/Mt Gilboa – 5 regular plus P. Chaves, B. Cohen, B. Melofchik as alternates Makowka will step in for Pleasant St**
- 4. Communications**
 - a. 0 Ravine Street applicant postponed to July 28th meeting
 - b. 275 Broadway will also be postponed to July 28th meeting
 - c. CONA applications received by S. Makowka which seemed minor but had elements that did not match criteria for a CONA due to small changes and hoping that 10 day certificates or approve as CONAS. 99 Westminster – application for roof replacement for like with like but as part of roof work want to add ventilation to attic and need to put a small 12 x 18 inch gable vent centered above window on front façade – all wood painted to match. Similar vents on cross gables not as visible from street. Other possibilities were not workable. B. Cohen said there was probably a vent there at some point. J. Worden moved that this request qualifies for a 10 day notification, seconded by Beth Cohen. Roll call – Baldwin – y, Barry – y, Tee - y, Worden -y, Chaves – y, Cohen – y, Bush – y. Motion to approve installation as proposed moved for approval by J. Worden, Seconded proposal by B. Cohen; Roll Call vote – Baldwin – y, Barry – y, Tee – y, Worden – y, Bush – y, Chaves – y, Cohen – y. Unanimous for both appropriateness and for the proposal. In similar vain – 109 Crescent Hill Ave. has a shed in the rear which will be removed and a new shed installed. Back portion of lot elevated above street and not really visible but shed at back of lot line but it is a large shed and would be visible – 150 feet away from the street.

Reeds ferry all wood shed in a design sympathetic to the district. Corners of shed are visible if you peer up driveway and over crest of hill. Would like a 10 day as well. J. Worden moved approval for appropriateness for a 10 day, seconded by D. Baldwin, roll call - Baldwin – y, Barry – y, Worden – y, Bush – y, Chaves – y, Cohen – y; J. Worden moved approval of applicant’s proposed Reeds Ferry Shed – seconded by D. Baldwin; roll call - Baldwin – y, Barry – y, Bush – y, Tee – y, Cohen – y, Chaves – y, Worden – y.

- d. B. Cohen reported that 87 Pleasant Street copper coping has been put back in place.

5. New Business

- a. Formal Hearing for 0 Ravine Street (Perlo) for new home construction – POSTPONED TO JULY 28, 2022
- b. Formal Hearing for 30 Jason Street (Harris) for siding replacement – C. Harris gave the presentation. Asking to replace the pitted aluminum siding with Everlast siding. Want to remove aluminum which is in terrible shape and in order to change the storm windows they need to remove the aluminum. Due to expense and durability they would prefer to put the Everlast siding up rather than wood shingles. The Everlast is an artificial material and typically not allowed in a district. Wood grain pattern being used. Commission applauds the applicant’s desire to remove the aluminum siding and wanting to go back to more appropriate look. Chair is concerned that composite is inconsistent with guidelines and precedent that will be set in the District. For fire safety this has been the only time we have allowed this to take place in a District. The composite material looks artificial even from a distance in that it is so consistent. The wood grain pattern stands out looking not like a smooth side clapboard. This gives him pause because of the look. J. Worden asked what is the fabric under aluminum – applicant responded that they don’t know for 100%. J. Worden is recusing himself from this hearing as an abutter and M. Bush will be the alternate for this hearing. Siding is off the back and there were remains of clapboards that had turned to dust under the aluminum. B. Cohen said when she removed the siding 25 years ago after having been up for 40 years and the siding was in good shape and she was able to repair it – combo clapboard and shingles. The other sides might be in better shape. The storm windows are tied into the siding. C. Barry said it’s a myth that composite materials last forever – M. Bush disagreed and said they aren’t as good as old wood, but there are high quality cedar shingles. M. Bush said traditional clapboards in Boston area would have been pine and historic houses are not cedar clapboards. It is his opinion that in many instances the Commission is too conservative on materials and too complacent on cost and this is a fine example of that situation. We allow fiberglass gutters when and we are going to assess on a case by case basis what the material is and what the economic impact is for the homeowner. We decline to consider economic considerations at our peril in his opinion. D. Baldwin said there is an 80% clapboard salvaging and would replacing 20% of clapboards be more expensive? His counsel to applicant if it were his house – would do some exploratory siding removal – use Tyvek to get you through the winter. D. Baldwin said if there is a restoration of the clapboards you would fall under the Arlington preservation fund loan program. B. Melofchik asked if the applicant were to replace like with like what would be used – aluminum. It is still available and would be a like with like replacement. The composite material is ¼ mineral composite and the rest is acrylic. One of the details of how it is handled at the corners is a concern. M. Bush is not proposing that we approve this tonight without further study. Dimensional clapboards

are cut to length and applied to the building. S. Makowka asked to explore using an all wood material to replace any siding that is not salvageable as an alternative to using composite material. The textured stuff screams fake nearby. The sample in Carol's office isn't making them comfortable. If there's a house they can visit to see how it looks in "real life". S. Makowka asked if we could approve removal of the siding but allow with restoration of wood with wood only and they can come back with additional info if they do want to approve composite material – though he discourages the precedent setting and doesn't want to give false hope. We would need all the details for the corners, etc. B. Cohen moved that applicant is by right allowed to remove aluminum to find out what is underneath and then make a decision to replace with like material or restore the original clapboards. M. Bush proposed we move that we are not ready to approve composite at this time. S. Makowka made motion to allow removal of siding anticipating repair of clapboard with all wood material (not composite as proposed) and if applicant decides to put aluminum siding on by right. Seconded by C. Barry. Roll call – Baldwin – y, Barry – y, Tee – y, Bush – y, Chaves – y, Cohen – y, Melofchik – yes; Unanimous vote.

- c. Formal Hearing for 48 Academy Street (Schultz) for window replacement – Nico Spadorcia from Renewal by Anderson gave presentation. D. Baldwin recused himself from voting due to being neighbors and M. Bush stepped in as an alternate. N. Schultz also attended. S. Makowka said application for visible window on side of house and slider on rear of house not visible. Slider approved by CONA and the side window needs approval. This is an addition in 2004 and not original. Dehydrated wood fibers blended with thermal polymers. It is not all wood. Double casement currently there – obliquely visible from the front and where it is only one window being replaced. Sherman Williams permanently embedded in the wood – oven baked on through a heating process. It is paintable. B. Cohen doesn't understand why they are not using wood windows. The precedent setting bothers her. If this was in a more prominent position she would vote no. M. Bush said he too agrees with the concern. This is not an original window. C. Barry is kind of with Beth and very concerned about the precedent of not replacing wood with wood. B. Cohen moved to deny the application to change to composite material in support of replacement only with all wood window. Seconded by C. Barry. Roll Call to Deny: C. Barry – y, Tee – y, Worden – y, Bush – n, Chaves – n, Cohen – y, Melofchik – n; 4 yes – 3 no's so motion to deny is approved on vote 4 to 3. Denial to be issued for visible window which would not have been all wood. CONA can be issued for slider and non-visible windows and a like for like all wood window replacement instead of the requested visible clad window which was denied. They would not need to come back for a CONA if all wood window is desired.
- d. Formal Hearing for 53 Westmoreland Ave. (Leahy) for porch rebuild – Lori Leahy gave presentation. House originally used as a two family and originally platform of staircase that was entrance to 2nd floor unit. Currently very unstable. Originally wanted to enclose both porches and now want to eliminate the top porch and enclose the bottom porch to become a mudroom. Back door would be a more historically appropriate one made of wood. It's a corner lot so you can see everything. S. Makowka said he thinks it looks great as proposed. Very consistent with other applications in the district. Seems not incongruous on this house. They would like to have a little window next to the door to let light. They may add 6 or 7 inches but set back on both sides to look better visually. Given we don't have real elevations we need more but the concept is being received very positively. M. Bush knows the project very well and is fully in support. Original foundation underneath is stone – on other side of staircase is open area where you can go around and enter basement. They

want to enclose that – if they poured cement could they try to match the stone foundation with sliced stone. B. Cohen said you can pour foundation and put lattice right on top. M. Bush suggested look at his bathroom. Explore a couple different options for the windows and they can see how it feels. Stairs turned sideways won't do anything to the requirement for the landing – but it wouldn't interfere with their little walkway already installed. Would like some type of overhang above the door – no problem with lots of little canopies – flat roof with couple of supporting brackets would be very appropriate. Continued to next month's 7/28 meeting – we would like to have an elevation showing the final proposal, including dimensions, list of materials and details of doors, stairs, railings, windows, etc. Will need 2 elevations to explain what you're doing. House is covered in aluminum. M. Bush said new clapboards and the aluminum would work out just fine. Save the aluminum you pull off and use it to patch some places not looking well. Applicant approves continuation to August and if they are ready to come in for July they can let Carol know.

- e. Continued Formal Hearing for 275 Broadway (275 Broadway LLC-Kew) for fence removal – POSTPONED TO JULY 28, 2022
- f. Continued Formal Hearing for 212 Pleasant St. (Aikenhead) for addition. N. Aikenhead gave presentation. Showed new roofline with pole. Turned into more flat roof than gable. 10.5' above highest point and did fine it visible from Pleasant Street. Some of the perspectives are off. Red line in photos added to show the top of the highest point of house. They are smaller than 11 others and larger than 4. In terms of massing smallest 2253, largest 7876 and they are at 3438 including basement. Smaller than 8, larger than 7 but closer to smaller rather than larger ones. In terms of decks – 144 sf deck proposed – bigger than 3 and smaller than other 9 which average closer to 500sf. Revised plans shown. Brought roof line down facing neighbors. Side facing blue house shows dormer and 2 levels and flat roof and front door and deck proposed. Back of house visible from pond kind of in keeping with houses down on route 2. Basement is at ground level in back but in front you don't see any of the basement level. It doesn't scream historical but house is not a contributing structure. The railing is cable on the decks. Overhang awning – kind of contemporary looking but others along the area are similar. They are 70 feet from the shore in the back and 100 feet from the front of the house. Pg. 22 of proposal – location plan – one corner of the land is under water. Wood windows, wood trim, clapboard siding. Windows – triple pane that will give high efficiency. Solar panels and all electric is hope. Proposing some very non traditional elements. Window shown is more sympathetic rather than crank out windows shown below in presentation. B. Cohen said there is a deck house next door and quite contemporary. Blue house is also contemporary. Casement windows or tilt turn aren't problem to Charles and Beth. M. Bush feels he'd rather see the modern windows. Opened up to public and no comments. M. Bush asked if we have a definitive set of plans. M. Bush said he is holy sympathetic but didn't have times to review plans in detail and would prefer to do that and would like to continue to next month. B. Cohen and C. Barry liked the design improvements. He emphasized all clad in wood – windows can be triple paned and still wood. M. Bush said this is another fine example about the discussion about modern materials. C. Barry disagreed and said wood exists all the time. Approve subject to condition of all wood materials or continue to next month and in interest in helping applicant approve all wood materials only allowed. Voting – David, Charles, Carol, John, Phil, Beth, Beth. C. Barry moved of project as submitted with provision that the exterior envelope be all wood and some of the details subject to approval by monitor prior to installation. B. Melofchik was not here last month and cannot be a voting alternate so A. Johnson is

- appointed as a voting member for this hearing. A. Johnson seconded motion. Roll call – Baldwin – y, Barry – y, Tee – y, Worden – y, Chaves – y, Cohen – y, Johnson – y Unanimous approval. Monitor appointed C. Barry.
- g. Continued Formal Hearing for 15 Wellington St. (Cohen) for addition. B. Cohen recused to present for herself. Changes made – 6 over 1 lite from Brosco catalog, only sash opening available. Elevation added to show the two windows in each gable 6 over 1 side by side. Pitch of dog house a little lower. Rafters 2 feet on center. Right now 1 is out and would need 1.5. M. Bush said this won't be any good and C. Barry agreed. So she would like approval for this but with wider dormer – adding another foot. Cutting another rafter will work. NO objection to changing the size and will allow better framing. Suggested motion would be to approve with these windows but with wider dormer allowing for trim around proposed windows to be more sympathetic to house. Move them a foot outboard and grow towards center so center line wall will stay the same. M. Bush moved approval in its general form subject to approval by monitor of revised dormer plans. Seconded by C. Barry. Roll call –Baldwin – y, Barry – y, Tee – y, Bush – y, Chaves – y, Johnson (apptd. as alternate) – y; Worden – abstained. Approval 6-0-1. Monitor appointed A. Johnson

6. Old Business

- a. Vacant commissioner seats -
- b. Report from Streetscape sub-committee
- c. Modification of Design Guidelines (Little Libraries)
- d. Town Clerk Record Retention

7. Review of projects

8. Executive Session to Discuss Ongoing Litigation regarding 0 Ravine (Perlo v AHDC) – Not required at this time.

10:15pm Motion to adjourn by A. Johnson, Seconded by M. Bush. Unanimous roll call to adjourn.

**C. Greeley to follow up on D. Heim on remote meetings for July and August
Meeting adjourned at 1015pm.**